A COUNTERCULTURE OF SADNESS

Rabbi Chaim Strauchler Tisha B'av 5777



A SPECIAL TIME:

1. Lamentations Chapter 1 איכה

ָטוּ סָלַה כַל אַבִּירַי אָד - נַי בִּקְרָבִּי, קַרָא עַלַי מוֹעֶד לְשָׁבֹּר בַּחוּרַי; גַּת דַּרַךְ אֶדנַי, לְבָתוּלַת בַּת יְהוּדֵה.

The Lord hath set at nought all my mighty men in the midst of me; He hath called a solemn assembly against me to crush my young men; the Lord hath trodden as in a winepress the virgin the daughter of Judah.'

2. Shulchan Arukh, Orach Chayim - Siman 552

ָאָין אוֹמְרִים תָּחָנַה עֶרֶב תִּשְּׁעַה בָּאב בָּמַנְחַה, מִשּׁוּם דְּאִיקְרֵי מוֹעֵד;

3. Aruch HaShulchan - 1:553

אין אומרים תחנון במנחה בערב תשעה באב, משום דאקרי "מועד". וכן אין אומרים "צדקתך צדק" במנחה שבת ערב תשעה באב. וגם בתשעה באב עצמו כן. והעניין הוא לסימן כי אנו מובטחים בהשם יתברך, שעוד יתהפכו הימים האלה למועדים ושמחה וימים טובים

4. **זכריה פרק ח (יט)** כה אמר ה' צבאות צום הרביעי וצום החמישי וצום השביעי וצום העשירי יהיה לבית יהודה לששון ולשמחה ולמעדים טובים והאמת והשלום אהבו:

Thus saith the LORD of hosts: The fast of the fourth month, and the fast of the fifth, and the fast of the seventh, and the fast of the tenth, shall be to the house of Judah joy and gladness, and cheerful seasons; therefore love ye truth and peace.

CONNECTION BETWEEN MOURNING AND REDEMPTION

5. תלמוד בבלי מסכת תענית דף ל עמוד ב וחכמים אומרים: כל העושה מלאכה בתשעה באב ואינו מתאבל על ירושלים אינו רואה בשמחתה, שנאמר +ישעיהו ס"ו+ שמחו את ירושלים וגילו בה כל אהביה שישו אתה משוש כל המתאבלים עליה. מכאן אמרו: כל המתאבל על ירושלים זוכה ורואה בשמחתה, ושאינו מתאבל על ירושלים אינו רואה בשמחתה.

And the Sages say: Whoever performs labor on the Ninth of Av and does not mourn for Jerusalem will not see her future joy, as it is stated: "Rejoice with Jerusalem and be glad with her, all who love her; rejoice for joy with her, all who mourn for her" (Isaiah 66:10). From here it is stated: Whoever mourns for Jerusalem will merit and see her future joy, and whoever does not mourn for Jerusalem will not see her future joy.

6. http://onthemainline.blogspot.ca/2011/08/on-napoleon-tisha-bav-legend-tracing-it.html

"Napoleon visited a synagogue in [usually Russia, but I've also seen versions which say Paris] on Tisha B'Av. Noticing the lamentations and expressions of mourning of the Jews, Napoleon asked the very question that a didactic folk tale would require him to ask: What's up with the Jews? It was explained that they are mourning for the destruction of their Temple. As per the requirements of the story, Napoleon asked when this Temple was destroyed. Informed that it was 1700 years earlier, Napoleon said that if indeed this people is mourning their Temple after 1700 years, such a people so attached to their history, will indeed be restored to their land and their Temple rebuilt."

7. תלמוד בבלי מסכת מכות דף כד עמוד ב שוב פעם אחת היו עולין לירושלים, כיון שהגיעו להר הצופים קרעו בגדיהם. כיון שהגיעו להר הבית, ראו שועל שיצא מבית קדשי הקדשים, התחילו הן בוכין ור"ע מצחק. אמרו לו: מפני מה אתה מצחק? אמר להם: מפני מה אתם בוכים? אמרו לו, מקום שכתוב בו: +במדבר א'+ והזר הקרב יומת ועכשיו שועלים הלכו בו ולא נבכה? אמר להן: לכך אני מצחק, דכתיב: +ישעיהו ח'+ ואעידה לי עדים נאמנים את אוריה הכהן ואת זכריה בן יברכיהו, וכי מה ענין אוריה אצל זכריה? אוריה במקדש ראשון וזכריה במקדש שני! אלא, תלה הכתוב נבואתו של זכריה בנבואתו של אוריה באוריה כתיב: +זכריה ח'+ עוד ישבו זקנים וזקנות ברחובות ירושלם, עד שלא נתקיימה נבואתו של אוריה הייתי מתיירא שלא תתקיים נבואתו של זכריה, עכשיו שנתקיימה נבואתו של אוריה בידוע שנבואתו של זכריה מתקיימת. בלשון הזה אמרו לו: עקיבא, ניחמתנו! עקיבא, ניחמתנו.

On another occasion they were ascending to Jerusalem after the destruction of the Temple. When they arrived at Mount Scopus and saw the site of the Temple, they rent their garments in mourning, in keeping with halakhic practice. When they arrived at the Temple Mount, they saw a fox that emerged from the site of the Holy of Holies. They began weeping, and Rabbi Akiva was laughing. They said to him: For what reason are you laughing? Rabbi Akiva said to them: For what reason are you weeping? They said to him: This is the place concerning which it is written: "And the non-priest who approaches shall die" (Numbers 1:51), and now foxes walk in it; and shall we not weep? Rabbi Akiva said to them: That is why I am laughing, as it is written, when God revealed the future to the prophet Isaiah: "And I will take to Me faithful witnesses to attest: Uriah the priest, and Zechariah the son of Jeberechiah" (Isaiah 8:2). Now what is the connection between Uriah and Zechariah? He clarifies the difficulty: Uriah prophesied during the First Temple period, and Zechariah prophesied during the Second Temple period, as he was among those who returned to Zion from Babylonia. Rather, the verse established that fulfillment of the prophecy of Zechariah is dependent on fulfillment of the prophecy of Uriah. In the prophecy of Uriah it is written: "Therefore, for your sake Zion shall be plowed as a field, and Jerusalem shall become rubble, and the Temple Mount as the high places of a forest" (Micah 3:12), where foxes are found. There is a rabbinic tradition that this was prophesied by Uriah. In the prophecy of Zechariah it is written: "There shall yet be elderly men and elderly women sitting in the streets of Jerusalem" (Zechariah 8:4). Until the prophecy of Uriah with regard to the destruction of the city was fulfilled I was afraid that the prophecy of Zechariah would not be fulfilled, as the two prophecies are linked. Now that the prophecy of Uriah was fulfilled, it is evident that the prophecy of Zechariah remains valid. The Gemara adds: The Sages said to him, employing this formulation: Akiva, you have comforted us; Akiva, you have comforted us.

A VALUE TO SADNESS

8. ירמיהו פרק לא יד כּה אָמַר ה', קוֹל בְּרָמָה נִשְׁמָע נְהִי בְּכִי תַמְרוּרִים רָחֵל, מְבַכָּה עַל בָּנֶיהָ; מֵאֲנָה לְהִנָּחֵם עַל בָּנֶיהָ, כִּי יֵשׁ שָׁכָר לִפְעֻלְּתֵךְ נְאָם ה', וְשְׁבוּ עַל בָּנֶיהָ, כִּי יֵשׁ שָׂכָר לִפְעֻלְּתֵךְ נְאָם ה', וְשְׁבוּ עַל בָּנֶיהָ, כִּי יֵשׁ שְׂכָר לִפְעֻלְּתֵךְ נְאָם ה', וְשְׁבוּ מֵאֶרֵץ אוֹיֵב. טז וְיֵשׁ תִּקְוָה לְאָחַרִיתָךְ, נָאָם ה'; וְשָׁבוּ בַנִים, לְגִבוּלָם.

Thus saith the LORD: A voice is heard in Ramah, lamentation, and bitter weeping, Rachel weeping for her children; she refuseth to be comforted for her children, because they are not. Thus saith the LORD: Refrain thy voice from weeping, and thine eyes from tears; for thy work shall be rewarded, saith the LORD; and they shall come back from the land of the enemy. And there is hope for thy future, saith the LORD; and thy children shall return to their own border.

PERMISSION TO BE SAD:

9. Erica Brown: In the Narrow Places

In addition, we live in a period that is enormously invested in happiness. Just type "books on happiness" into Amazon and see what you come up with (by my count, it's close to 17,000). We guard our happiness closely, and do not want to mar it with sad thoughts. We fail to view suffering as a natural part of human life – living in such relative comfort as we do, suffering always takes us by surprise, as if it were an injustice. And as it is an injustice, we look for someone to blame. Sharon Salzberg, in her book Lovingkindness, points out that

we feel obliged to defend our happiness because it seems so fragile, unstable. As though our happiness needed constant protection, we deny the very possibility of suffering; we cut ourselves off from facing it in ourselves and in others because we fear that it will undermine or destroy our good fortune.

Suffering humanizes us. Ignoring suffering dehumanizes us. I don't want to ruin my good mood by looking at that homeless person, so I turn away – and with that turning, I let go of my social responsibility to him. Attunement to suffering makes us more compassionate. It also helps us appreciate where we come from and all that it took to get us to where we are. We have to remind ourselves that we don't diminish our happiness when we spend a day or a few weeks meditating on the tragedies of history from which we emerged. We become more grateful, holding on tightly to our blessed lives because we can.

- 10. Carl Jung: Even a happy life cannot be without a measure of darkness, and the word happy would lose its meaning if it were not balanced by sadness.
- 11. http://www.bbc.com/future/story/20170601-can-writing-about-pain-make-you-heal-faster

In 1986 the psychology professor James Pennebaker discovered something extraordinary, something which would inspire a generation of researchers to conduct several hundred studies. He asked students to spend 15 minutes writing about the biggest trauma of their lives or, if they hadn't experienced a trauma, their most difficult time.

They were told to let go and to include their deepest thoughts, even if they had never shared these thoughts before. Four days running they did the same thing. It wasn't easy. Pennebaker told me that roughly one in 20 students would end up crying, but when asked

whether they wanted to continue they always did. Meanwhile a control group spent the same number of sessions writing a description of something neutral such a tree or their dorm room.

Then he waited for six months while monitoring how often the students visited the health centre. The day he saw the results, he left the lab, walked to his friend who was waiting for him in a car and told him he'd found something big. Remarkably, the students who had written about their secret feelings had made significantly fewer trips to the doctor in the subsequent months.

12. From "Making Tisha B'Av More Meaningful" by Rebbetzin Meira Davis

I just finished my Seudah Hamafseket of bread and a hard-boiled egg dipped in ashes and salt water. Well, the salt water was from my tears — guess I was in the moment. I decided to take a few moments before I head over to shul to hear Eicha and share a few of my thoughts with you.

I've been dreading Tisha B'Av for a few weeks now, ever since I realized that it is the day I'll say goodbye to my sister and her family before they move to Israel. Of course, this is not a tragedy, chas v'shalom, quite the opposite. Making Aliya, fulfilling the dream of living life in Eretz Yisrael, where just the mere act of living daily life becomes intrinsically more meaningful — this is certainly the opposite of a tragedy.

But it is not the same, going from being able to see someone frequently, to just once or twice a year. I'm trying my best not to complain, to lament every time I talk to anyone about this, but my heart is breaking inside me.

This is what Galut is — to feel my family apart with an ocean between us. This is not an oppression of the body, but an oppression of the soul. We are a diverse family, and I am so proud of all that we represent and accomplish. But diversity

means we have different goals, different desires, and different ways to reach and fulfill them.

I live in my own personal Galut. I am alone, and most of the time I am lucky not to be lonely. But where is my husband? Where are my children? I feel barren inside sometimes. , מוֹשִׁיבִי הַ מִּלְלִּיי, הּ. מִלְלִּיי, הּ. שְׁמָחָה: הַלְלִּיי, הּ. שְׁמָחָה: הַלְלִיי, הּ. He restores the barren woman to the house, into a joyful mother of children. Halleluy-ah (Tehillim 113:9)."

Most days, it may not be appropriate to express such strong feelings freely. But today is the most dramatic day of mourning of the year in the history of the Jewish people. So let me be dramatic today. Let me bare my heart, my pain, and my tears to you. And let me not be ashamed. For maybe this too will help the Geulah come closer.

So why am I baring my soul right now? A verse in Eicha struck me in particular (1:20): רְאָה ה' כִּי צֵר לִי, מֵעִי חָמֵרְמָרוּ "See, Hashem, how distressed I am, my insides churn; my heart is turned over within me..." I need to say to my family, "See!" I'm burning inside, and my heart is turned over, and you are the people I love most in this world, so I need you to hear me. Just

listen, nothing else. "A Song of Ascents. Out of the depths I cry to You, O Lord. Lord, listen to my voice; let Your ears be attentive to the voice of my supplications (Tehillim 130:1-2)." Sometimes I feel like Hashem doesn't hear me. How many times have I shed tears on Yom Kippur, praying for myself and for so many others? "My soul remembers well, and makes me despondent." (Eicha 3:20) And yet... "Yet, this I bear in my heart, and I will still hope" (Eicha 3:21). This resonates so strongly within me, and the same theme runs within Tehillim 130 (my favorite perek): "I hope for Hashem, my soul hopes, and in His word, I hope (Tehillim 130:5)."

Somehow I hope. Whether it is my inconsistent faith in Hashem, my everlasting love for my family, or some unknown strength within me, I hope. On a day like today, I can think of the words from HaTikvah: "Our hope is not yet lost, the hope of two thousand years." I am blessed to see my own family living in Eretz Yisrael, I am blessed that I can be so close to my family, I am blessed, I am blessed, I am blessed. "How can I repay Hashem for all his kindness toward me? (Tehillim 116:12)" Even though I cry and mourn, I am thankful.

We begin a new book of the Torah this Shabbat. We confront a reality of homelessness – the Jews are at the cusp of the land of Israel – looking in.

Living from within a perspective of destruction:

A person who can withstand pressure – Sessions / republican senators / Jews through the ages

Exile connected to Redemption

Types of Exile:

Exile from the World

Exile from the Self

Exile from Transcendence

Exile of God

Exile from God